DOI: 10.20472/IAC.2018.036.001

MUJITABA ABUBAKAR TANGAZA
Sokoto State Polytechnic, Nigeria

TIJJANI MOHAMMED
Federal University, Gashuwa, Nigeria

UNDERSTANDING CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT PROCESS IN THE NIGERIAN RETAIL BANKING CONTEXT

Abstract:

The basis for relationship marketing is to maximize benefit and long-term bonding between the firm and a customer. Based on these premises, scholars explore how relationship is implemented across business and national context. In one of such studies, Reinarzt and Kumar (2004) explore relationship management implementation based on the premises that relationship follows three stages: relationship initiation, relationship management, and termination. However, at every stage certain processes do occur. These processes that occur at every stage remain unexplored at country level. Countries possess heterogeneous social as well economic conditions that define business operation in a specific country. Thus this paper investigates relationship implementation in Nigeria based on two premises: 1) what are the factors that affect relationship initiation, management, and termination in Nigerian retail banking context? How external factors affect relationship effectiveness and performance? Based on 27 semi-structured interviews, this study therefore provides empirical investigation that addresses two main issues. One, the paper shows interpersonal relationship, a technique employed for both relationship initiation and management, remains one of the important factor even at retail banking context. Due to environmental challenge, the positive implication on technology deployment on relationship management in retail context of Nigerian banks is small, social connections have significant influence on retail banking relationship.

Keywords:

Understanding Customer Relationship Management Process in the Nigerian Retail banking context

JEL Classification: M00

Introduction

The basis for relationship marketing is to maximize benefit and long-term bonding between the firm and a customer. To achieve this aim, firms implement different methods to ensure trust between customer and firm through polices that improve satisfaction and long term relationship. As such, technology and human effort are being developed by companies to capture and identify customer needs that result in customer loyalty and well functioning relationship. Although well functioning relationship is based on different methods that deploy the potential of relationship marketing (RM) and customer relationship management CRM), in a market with large customer base, CRM is being largely deployed to manage customer-bank relationship. It is used to reduce cost in contact management and generate data for relationship development and management, although its application draws diverse view.

Reinarzt and Kumar (2004) describe relationship management implementation based on the premises that relationship follows three stages: relationship initiation, relationship management, and termination. Several studies explored relationship management from this perspective with the view that at every stage certain processes do occur. Every stage generates certain benefit to the company. For instance, process at relationship initiation stage result in increased customer volume and sales. Processes at relationship management focus on exploring the potential of few profitable customers and how to manage them.

However, we noticed that these processes may likely change based on country context, as countries possess heterogeneous social as well economic condition that affect how business operate in a specific country context. This challenge, which demonstrates the shortage of research that examines how country context affect CRM at relationship initiation, management, and termination stage remains unexplored. Knowledge about how country context affect stages of relationship management and promote customer loyalty is highly needed. Consequently, this paper investigates relationship implementation in Nigeria based on two premises: 1) what are the factors that affect relationship initiation, management, and termination in Nigerian retail banking context? How these factors affect relationship effectiveness and performance? Based on these two main questions, the study examines the process banks undertake during relationship initiation, management, and how customer churn are manage. Many respondents to the interview mentioned that banks perform different activities at both stages. However, the strategic objective of the banks determines which stage carries attention. Because of the emerging nature of the retail banking in Nigeria, banks focus on customer acquisition and referral to increase their customer base and market growth. At management level, banks personalise their approach to service delivery in such that interpersonal relationship take centre stage.

Literature review

CRM is relationship management approach that promotes the use of company policies and processes enabled by technology to initiate and maintain relationships with customers. Although technology defines relationship through its precision in customer data collection and analysis, organisational process supported by human effort compliment the use of technology. Therefore the combine effort of technology and human effort result in effective firm-customer relationship in consumer market (Winer, 2001).

CRM promote organisational processes that support customer satisfaction to generate relationships with profitable customers (Agariya & Singh, 2011; Payne & Frow, 2013; Soltani & Navimipour, 2016). In this approach, processes that create brand and company loyalty are promoted and their consequences in relationship initiation and management are seen as the significant success of the strategy (Iriana, Buttle, & Ang, 2013; Kim & Kim, 2009). The main aim of CRM is to isolate the high impact of interpersonal relationship and use technology-enabled channels (e.g., emails, call centre, and telephones) to contact customers to create enduring relationships with the company (Kim, Eun, Dubinsky & Chaiy, 2012; Reinaizt et al., 2004).

However, building and managing customer relationships in business to consumer (B2C) market is practiced on three level of the organisation: at a functional level, customer-facing level and companywide or macro level of the organisation. In the literature on customer relationship management implementation, the customer-facing level and companywide receive high acknowledgement based on the seminal papers of Dwyer, Schurr, & Oh (1987), Reinartz et al. (2004) and Payne and Frow (2005). Dwyer et al. (1987) and Reinartz et al. (2004) conceptualise CRM implementation at the customer-facing level, and their work was highly cited in the relationship management literature. While Payne and Frow (2005) promoted companywide management in their paper, the most cited article in CRM implementation research.

CRM implementation at customer-facing level

CRM processes at the customer-facing level include activities performed by frontline, customer-facing staff, and customer-facing units during customer relationship initiation, relationship management, and churn management (Mumuni & O'Reilly, 2014). It also includes how organisations collate customer information at different customer contact points for relationship activities (Rababah, Mohd, & Ibrahim, 2010; Reinartz et al., 2004). Reinartz et al. (2004) promoted this view in their seminal paper on customer relationship management. Their view is based on a suggestion by Dwyer et al. (1987) that managing customer relationships follows a distinct pattern or stages and in every stage, the company performs processes that ensure the success of customer relationship marketing to achieve marketing concepts.

In their study, Dwyer et al. (1987) highlighted processes of relationship management: relationship initiation process, relationship maintenance, and customer churn management. At every stage of the relationship, processes that ensure successful implementation of the customer relationship are conducted between the company and customer or group of customers. This model by Dwyer et al. (1987) lay the foundation for relationship marketing implementation, and further research supports the use of technology for relationship marketing processes.

At the relationship initiation stage, an interaction between company and customers is encouraged through the use of different channels of communication as emphasised by Dwyer et al. (1987) and Reinartz et al. (2004). Later processes focus on the identification of potential customers and how their relationships with the firm are develop and moved to the next stage of maintenance **(**Zhang, Watson, Palmatier, & Dant, 2016). During identification and evaluation of customers, individuals or groups of regular customers that display profit potential are targeted. At the maintenance stage, various processes that align the organisation's structure with relationship maintenance-compatible behaviour are encouraged and implemented. This approach to relationship management has also been suggested by Becker, Greve & Albers, (2009), Kim and Kim (2009), Mumuni and O’Reilly (2014), Reimann, Schilke, and Thomas (2010) and Valmohammadi and Beladpas (2014).

According to Mumuni and O’Reilly (2014), relationship management processes at the customer -facing level can be outlined as obtaining customers, identification of profitable customers and developing the best options to manage them through certain processes that give the firm a competitive advantage at the relationship initiation stage and maintenance stage, and in deploying effective management of relationship termination.

At relationship initiation, different mediums of communication that bring a customer to the firm are used to initiate the relationship (Kumar & Reinartz, 2012; Reinartz et al., 2004). As reflected by Dwyer et al. (1987), customer acquisition and evaluation of high potential customers were cited by Mumuni and O’Reilly (2014) and Reinartz et al. (2004) as the major process of relationship initiation. At this stage, managers and scholars have different views on customer acquisition; two perspectives exist. In the first viewpoint, information technology is used to identify high potential customers among the already acquired customers and established relationships with them based on customised offerings (Foss, Stone, & Ekinci, 2008; Winer, 2001). However, as Farquhar and Panther (2008), Reinartz et al. (2004), and Valmohammadi and Beladpas (2014) report, in many instances, a firm engages in customer acquisition where a whole new set of customers are acquired and establish relationships with them based on either product-centric or customer-centric approach. Although Reinartz et al. (2004) and Srivastava, Shervani & Fahey (1999) argued that different processes are conducted at each stage, in what they term a “growing consensus”, Farquhar and Panther (2008, p. 10) believe customer acquisition/relationship initiation and customer retention are related. Customer acquisition is a subset of the firm’s relationship management strategy, as relationships established at the acquisition level set the stage for customer retention.

Reflecting Reinartz et al. (2004), Becker et al. (2009) believe that at the relationship initiation stage the focus is on identifying new potential customers and building the customer base of the company. According to Becker et al. (2009) and Cambra-Fierro et al. (2016), people-driven processes rather than technology-enabled channels prove more effective in relationship management at this stage. For Becker et al. (2009), changes in organisational structure carried out through training and reward systems for employees and customer orientation support CRM implementation at this stage; because new potential customers will prefer to have contact with people rather than with machines.

At the maintenance stage, processes that give firms competitive advantage on cross-selling and up-selling are deployed to manage customer interaction at every customer-firm contact point (Reimann et al., 2010; Valmohammadi & Beladpas, 2014). According to Mumuni and O'Reilly (2014), Kim and Kim (2009), and Becker et al. (2009), processes that ensure sustainable relationships based on managing interaction channels such as face-to-face, mail, email and call centre are performed to support relationship maintenance. At this stage, the information system allows collection, storage, analysis, and access to customer information to enable coordination and dissemination of customer knowledge for customer management functions such as marketing, sales, and customer service support. Supporting this view, Ata and Toker (2012), Papadopoulos, Ojiako, Chipulu, and Lee (2012), Yang (2012) and Jaber and Simkin (2016) believe effective alignment between CRM-compatible behaviour and organisational structure that internalise customer orientation should be encouraged to boost relationship management. They highlight that firms that develop incentives and organisational schemes that encourage compatible relationship orientation habits and attitudes at both customer acquisition and retention stages see improved relationship performance.

Although relationship termination is not intended at the beginning of the relationship, this can happen at any time (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; Payne & Frow, 2013; Reinartz et al., 2004; Zhang et al., 2016). However, firms adopt a tactical approach to monitoring customer satisfaction and any drop in a customer's activities (Zhang et al., 2016). Although in the B2B environment this could be easily identified, in the consumer market it proves quite challenging. Unsatisfied customers can silently cease to patronise a firm because there is no single outlined procedure for ending the relationship with the bank (Reinartz et al., 2005). Some customers can silently leave the company when the benefit derived from the relationship ceases to satisfy them (Payne & Frow, 2013; Reinartz et al., 2004). In this case, Winer (2001) and Payne and Frow (2005) have promoted satisfaction measurement techniques to measure customer satisfaction rate. As a result, firms can identify customers' defection warning signs and hence adopt measures for reducing customer churn to mitigate relationship termination.

Mumuni and O'Reilly (2014) concluded that relationship initiation, maintenance, and churn management are separate activities under CRM implementation processes. They, at the same time, impact firm performance based on their individual dimension to CRM implementation. Just like Reinartz et al. (2004) and Becker et al. (2009), Mumuni and

O'Reilly (2014) believe an organisational structure that supports CRM activities and customer-oriented behaviour has an impact on relationship initiation, development, and retention. Therefore, measuring company performance at relationship initiation (measuring market growth), relationship management (measuring company profit based on the performance of profitable customers), and churn management (based on overall customer satisfaction) can result in effective relationship management.

Becker et al. (2009), Mumuni and O'Reilly (2014) and Reinartz et al. (2004) believe that management of customer relationships at the customer-facing level requires the development of separate process at each stage of the relationship. Although the success of the relationship initiation can affect relationship maintenance, the relationship initiation stage is people-intensive. While maintenance and retention stages require alignment of customer-oriented organisational structure to support achievement of relationship marketing objectives: marketing concept. By implication, customer acquisition of a set of new customers has been found to be an important activity of relationship management. Relationship-oriented philosophy support both customer acquisition and relationship management as evidenced in the conclusion of **(**Jan & Abdullah, 2014). Although countries possess heterogeneous context and thus process at customer acquisition, relationship management may likely differs with economic development and technological advancement. Hence an inquiry that explores how relationship management processes occur in the Nigerian retail banking context is significant.

Research methodology

This paper is base on qualitative research method. It aims to explore how relationship management is being undertaken in the Nigerian retail banking context. This approach is adopted due to the paucity of research on how banks perform relationship management activities within the Nigerian banking context (Mellahe and Moi, 2015). Thus the main source of primary data is semi structured interview and documentations.

Twenty seven semi-structured interviews were conducted with bank managers, which formed the main sources of primary data (Table 1). Managers were purposefully selected from banks based on their expected experience and understanding of the research problem (Creswell, 2012; Merriam, 2014). The conduct of the interviews is based on face-to-face interaction with bank managers in an informal format that enable managers present their views on the main research issues. First, 21 middle level managers were interviewed and then 6 top level managers were interviewed to validate the views of middle level managers. The model is adopted to enable researchers explore new things rarely reported in the previous research, and hence strengthen validity (Breidbach, Kolb, & Srinivasan, 2013; Carson, Gilmore, Perry, & Gronhaug, 2001). So, as discussion continues, important issues related to the research questions were sorted and strengthened with further interviews until it was confirm that additional interviews from both two level managers will not offer additional insight (Bryman, 2012; Creswell, 2014).

Likewise, other qualitative data, such as bank reports, KPMG annual report on banking in sub-Saharan Africa (KPMG, 2014), Nigerian banking industry customer satisfaction survey (KPMG, 2014), financial inclusion studies in Nigerian context (EFInA, 2014, 2016) and literature on banking sector reforms in Sub-Saharan Africa (Mauro, Daniela, & Rodolfo, 2015; PwC, 2015), were used to triangulate the data and enhance research validity (Patton, 2002).

Table 1 Research participants

No	Age Bracket	Length Of Service (Years)	Management Level
R2	50-60	23	Executive Director retail and Commercial banking
R2	50-60	19	Divisional Head retail Banking
R3	50-60	24	Group Head and Business Development manager retail Banking
R4	40-50	15	Group Head and Business Development manager retail Banking
R5	40-50	15	Group Head and Business Development manager retail Banking
R6	40-50	15	Account Manager/Relationship Manager
R7	40-50	13	Account Manager/Relationship Manager
R8	35-45	13	Account Manager/Relationship Manager
R9	25-35	9 years	Account office/customer service officer
R10	50-60	26	Deputy General Manager/Group Head
R11	50-60	23	Business Development Manager
R12	50-60	21	Business Development Manager

As for data analysis, data was analysed using Yin (2010) dissembling and reassembling methods. At disassembling methods, after the transcription of the interviews, interviews were broken into piece of information in such that sentence or paragraph is broken into a meaningful chunk of data: codes (Saldaña, 2012). At this stage, about 40 codes were generated. Thus, the entire data set coded, and a word in a sentence that depicts significant information in the sentence or paragraph is used as a code to summarize phrase, sentence or sentences.

Findings of the study

Key objectives of the study are to identify key processes of customer relationship management in the Nigerian retail banking context. Based on customer facing level approach to CRM implementation, CRM activities focused on relationship initiation, management, and relationship termination. At relationship initiation, we identified customer acquisition and referral as fundamental components of CRM. At relationship management, personalisation of service delivery remains important as against depersonalisation of service delivery supported by technology in several western CRM literature.

Relationship Initiation

Banks use many ways of attracting customers mostly personal basis and mass marketing, which is through market storming, the use of social media, and advertisement. The relationship initiation process for mass retail customers is through mass marketing. Bank branch develop strategies of mass customer acquisition, as marketing team in each branch are more likely to get customer through market storming. In consonance with Beck et al. (2013), marketing team selects a place to visit, usually where potential customers are concentrated. Marketing teams target places like market days, where small traders who earn micro income gather and meet with potential buyers and transact buying and selling activities. They visit other public places like offices, schools, and any other place where marketers expect to get new potential customers who fall within this category of income.

For most of the retail customers at lower level income, an act that implies traditional marketing is important to them. Thus, on the site, marketing teams display their bank logo through their branded shirts symbolising who they are and their bank. Any potential customer they come across, they engage them. Specific questions are asked such as awareness of the bank and its products. Those that are aware but have no account with the bank will be solicited to open one. Marketers will explain to them what the bank has and its potential: the product that would suit customers based on their personal and business needs.

While traditional marketing methods are predominantly in use for customer acquisition, social media facilitate acquisition of elite low-income customers. Most of the banks have Facebook and Twitter accounts, and customers who like or follow the bank on Facebook or Twitter pages can use these platforms to open an account with the bank. Even though interview data and documents on Nigerian banks show low patronage of electronic media in banking communications and transactions, banks created a column that will enable potential customers to open an account and then go to a branch and complete the account opening process.

Interpersonal and personalisation of customer acquisition Small and medium business owners have significant number in the Nigerian retail market. These customers seem to be less enthusiastic about banking. Banks refocuses relationship initiation of these of customers based on building social connection and interpersonal contact. This technique of social connection facilitates understanding customer preference, likes and dislikes, and important information on customer is sought by the banks to ease relationship initiation. One of the bank managers reported that most small medium owners are retail customers and there is need for banks to understand their business and how they operate before engaging them into banking relationship. They formed important segment of the market, and they operate informal business. Banks employ more from the locality and stress the role of frontline staff in initiating banking relationship with this kind of customers. Respondent to the study reported that several customers value this interpersonal approach to relationship initiation. They respect people from their locality. Due to weak public system trust, customers lean to bank that have most of the people from their locality as employees. Because people are more relax giving information to the people that they knew. Unlike reported depersonalization of relationship initiation in CRM literature, there is huge evidence that support personalisation and interpersonal contact in relationship initiation in the Nigerian banking context.

Relationship Management

Similar with relationship initiation, relationship management follows a series of processes that ensure customers are properly retained. Banks place important on customers with future profit potentials. Services that support customer satisfaction are supplemented by interpersonal contact and relationship (Johnson and Perterson, 2014). Bank support depersonalization through technology supported means of communication and contact. However, constrained by the environment, face to face interaction dominates service delivery which ultimately encourage interpersonal and personal means of communication and service delivery. The weak system trust positively impacted the use of interpersonal channels in relationship management. As such, relationship management draws substantially on face-to-face interaction and the interpersonal relationship between customer and bank employees. Nearly all the managers deemed personal touch hugely important. A bank manager report that the banks engage in interpersonal activities to ensure social support to compliment technology supported means of communication and service delivery.

Face-to-face interaction is done through both formal and informal media. The bank engages in marketing calls through customer visits at their business places, some in their offices. During these visits, the bank interacts with the customer on a one-to-one basis, seeks his views on the bank’s services, and offers both professional and personal advice to customer. At the same time, the bank places phone calls to customers at intervals, in some cases as frequent as three times a week in order to show appreciation of some of his transactions and continued stay with the bank, hence bringing the customer closer to the bank.

Similarly, the bank engages customers into interpersonal relationships by attending customer's personal events such as birthday, anniversary, naming ceremony, marriage ceremony, and many occurences deemed to be important by the customer in order to strengthen relationship quality and enshrine trust, commitment and future relationship growth. Hence customer place trust on banks with inperperonl support that support service delivery.

Reflecting the conclusion of Kumar et al. (2013) and Beck, Chapman, et al. (2015), managers argued that due to high need for social satisfaction, interpersonal relationship shapes and influences the direction of the customer commitment. For many customers, personal visitation symbolizes affection and concern, consequently, additional satisfaction, trust, and confidence flow between bank and customer, which can translate into a long-lasting relationship.

Relationship Termination management

Interview results disclosed that unlike at customer acquisition and retention stages where interpersonal effort plays important role in relationship process, at termination management technology has significant influence in dictating customers with defection sign. Especially small customers whose account is small and bank use little interpersonal effort to management them. As one Manager reports, banks deploy "technology to get the report on how many accounts are inactive over a period of three months or six months". Those in active accounts attract much attention and bank move to redeem them and prevent defection to competitors. There technology, specifically CRM systems that monitor customer complaint management assist in improving customer satisfaction and hence customer retention. This signifies the uses of technology in customer complaint management, as the performance of staff is measured based on how effectively they were able to report and attend to the customer complaint from their own end (Payne and Frow, 2005). This performance measurement effort improves customer management and the overall customer's satisfaction rate, and hence defection rate. A bank manager who manages several account in a given branch mentioned that every branch monitor their customers. "A substantial amount of staff is developed on tracking customers' record and ensuring their complaints were attended to reduce likelihood of defection".

One Manager from one of the largest banks in the country reported steady role of human effort. After weak customers were identified, human efforts support customer retention. As reported by another Manager "Staff use personal money and paid into the customer account would not go dormant". Human effort in position support technology in relationship termination management. One manager further explained that certain processes outlined by the bank to ensure customer satisfaction and tracking of customers with defection signs are in place. However, the effort made by staff at branch level to maintain bank customer base prevents customer churn and termination of relationship bank has with a customer.

Discussion, findings and Conclusion.

Given the observations made by different research participants, it is apparent that the role of person-to-person interaction is prominent. This is not surprising given the secondary sources' views on Nigerians banks (EFInA, 2014, 2016; KPMG, 2014; Wale et al., 2017). They argue that a large percentage of customers are not profitable because of their low income, which prevents them from accessing products such as loans, insurance, and mortgages. Similarly, weak infrastructure restrains access to customers and generation of vital customer knowledge that will display multiple perspectives of customer views and needs. This challenge empowers single channel approaches and strengthens the role of interpersonal relationship at both relationship initiation and management. Therefore, as the structure is built to support customer-facing staff (Maklan, 2014), the entire perception those customer-facing staff manifested about relationship management is the act of relationship initiation and management to ensure long lasting relationships through organisational process that support interpersonal relationship marketing techniques.

For CRM implementation process in Nigerian banks, it is based on three processes that include relationship initiation, management, and termination management. At relationship initiation process that support mass marketing and interpersonal effort get high support. When customer acquisition is complete, banks use different techniques to ensure their retention. At this stage, banks use techniques such as customer visitation, relationship marketing activities through interpersonal relationships, and the use of technology to obtain customer information and strengthen the relationship. At relationship termination, technology plays a vital role in dictating which account is in an inactive position. Then, the bank can design a marketing strategy to revive the relationship. This is against the findings of Reinart et al. (2004) because their findings show little impact on reinvigorating relationships at this stage.

Conclusively, the study discovers that at both relationship initiation and management impersonal effort of the frontline staff is significant in customer relationship management. And technology

Reference

Agariya, A. K., & Singh, D. (2011). What really defines relationship marketing? A review of definitions and general and sector-specific defining constructs. *Journal of Relationship Marketing, 10*(4), 203-237.

Ata, U. Z., & Toker, A. (2012). The effect of customer relationship management adoption in business-to-business markets. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing, 27*(6), 497-507.

Becker, J. U., Greve, G., & Albers, S. (2009). The impact of technological and organizational implementation of CRM on customer acquisition, maintenance, and retention. *International Journal of Research in Marketing, 26*(3), 207-215.

Breidbach, C. F., Kolb, D. G., & Srinivasan, A. (2013). Connectivity in Service Systems Does Technology-Enablement Impact the Ability of a Service System to Co-Create Value? *Journal of Service Research, 16*(3), 428-441.

Bryman, A. (2012). *Social Research Methods*: Oxford university press.

Cambra-Fierro, J. J., Centeno, E., Olavarria, A., & Vazquez-Carrasco, R. (2016). Success factors in a CRM strategy: technology is not all. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 1-18.

Carson, D., Gilmore, A., Perry, C., & Gronhaug, K. (2001). Qualitative Marketing Research: Sage.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*: Sage.

Dwyer, F. R., Schurr, P. H., & Oh, S. (1987). Developing buyer-seller relationships. *The Journal of Marketing*, 11-27.

EFInA. (2014). EFInA Access to Financial Services in Nigeria 2014 Survey (Report). Retrieved 17/09/2015 http://www.efina.org.ng/our-work/research/access-to-financial-services-in-nigeria-survey/efina-access-to-financial-services-in-nigeria-2014-survey/

EFInA. (2016). *Access to Financial Services in Nigeria 2016 Survey*. Retrieved from Nigeria: http://www.efina.org.ng/assets/ResearchDocuments/a2f2016/Updated/Focus-Group-Discussions-2016-Key-Findings.pdf

Farquhar, J. D., & Panther, T. (2008). Acquiring and retaining customers in UK banks: An exploratory study. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services, 15*(1), 9-21.

Foss, B., Stone, M., & Ekinci, Y. (2008). What makes for CRM system success—Or failure? *Journal of Database Marketing & Customer Strategy Management, 15*(2), 68-78.

Iriana, R., Buttle, F., & Ang, L. (2013). Does organisational culture influence CRM's financial outcomes? *Journal of Marketing Management, 29*(3-4), 467-493.

Jaber, F., & Simkin, L. (2016). Unpicking antecedents of CRM adoption: a two-stage model. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 1-20.

Johnson, D., & Peterson, M. (2014). Consumer financial anxiety: US regional financial service firms' trust building response to the financial crisis. *International Journal of Bank Marketing, 32*(6), 515-533.

Kim, H.-S., & Kim, Y.-G. (2009). A CRM performance measurement framework: Its development process and application. *Industrial Marketing Management, 38*(4), 477-489.

Kim, M., Eun, P. J., Dubinsky, A. J., & Chaiy, S. (2012). Frequency of CRM implementation activities: a customer-centric view. *Journal of Services Marketing, 26*(2), 83-93.

KPMG. (2014, Sebtember 7). Banking in Sub-Saharan Africa. Retrieved from http://www.africanbusinesscentral.com/2015/09/07/banking-in-sub-saharan-africa-2015-kmpg-report/

Kumar, V., & Reinartz, W. (2012). *Customer relationship management: Concept, strategy, and tools*: Springer Science & Business Media.

Maklan, S., Knox, S., & Antonetti, P. (2014). Building a Sustainable Bank: The Case of GTBank of Nigeria. *Thunderbird International Business Review, 56*(5), 461-473.

Merriam, S. B. (2014). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*: John Wiley & Sons.

Morgan, R. M., & Hunt, S. D. (1994). The commitment-trust theory of relationship marketing. *The Journal of Marketing*, 20-38.

Mumuni, A. G., & O'Reilly, K. (2014). Examining the impact of customer relationship management on deconstructed measures of firm performance. *Journal of Relationship Marketing, 13*(2), 89-107.

Papadopoulos, T., Ojiako, U., Chipulu, M., & Lee, K. (2012). The criticality of risk factors in customer relationship management projects. *Project Management Journal, 43*(1), 65-76.

Patton, M. Q. (2002). *Qualitative research and evaluation methods* (3th ed. ed.): SAGE Publications, inc.

Payne, A., & Frow, P. (2005). A strategic framework for customer relationship management. *Journal of Marketing, 69*(4), 167-176.

Payne, A., & Frow, P. (2013). *Strategic customer management: integrating relationship marketing and CRM*: Cambridge University Press.

Rababah, K., Mohd, H., & Ibrahim, H. (2010). *A unified definition of CRM towards the successful adoption and implementation.* Paper presented at the the 3rd Lifelong Learning International Conference (3LInC'10), Kuala Lumpur-Malaysia.

Reimann, M., Schilke, O., & Thomas, J. S. (2010). Customer relationship management and firm performance: the mediating role of business strategy. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science, 38*(3), 326-346.

Reinartz, W., Krafft, M., & Hoyer, W. D. (2004). The customer relationship management process: Its measurement and impact on performance. *Journal of Marketing Research, 41*(3), 293-305.

Saldaña, J. (2012). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*: Sage.

Soltani, Z., & Navimipour, N. J. (2016). Customer relationship management mechanisms: A systematic review of the state of the art literature and recommendations for future research. *Computers in Human Behavior, 61*, 667-688.

Srivastava, R. K., Shervani, T. A., & Fahey, L. (1999). Marketing, business processes, and shareholder value: an organizationally embedded view of marketing activities and the discipline of marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 168-179.

Valmohammadi, C., & Beladpas, M. (2014). Customer relationship management and service quality, a survey within the banking sector. *Industrial and Commercial Training, 46*(2), 77-83.

Wale, L. E., Wale, L. E., Makina, D., & Makina, D. (2017). Account ownership and use of financial services among individuals: Evidence from selected Sub-Saharan African economies. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies, 8*(1), 19-35.

Winer, R. S. (2001). A framework for customer relationship management. *California Management Review, 43*(4), 89-105.

Yang, Y.-F. (2012). Service capabilities and customer relationship management: an investigation of the banks in Taiwan. *The Service Industries Journal, 32*(6), 937-960.

Yin, R. K. (2010). *Qualitative research from start to finish*: Guilford Press.

Zhang, J. Z., Watson IV, G. F., Palmatier, R. W., & Dant, R. P. (2016). Dynamic relationship marketing. *Journal of Marketing, 80*(5), 53-75.